

Trafficking in children for sexual purposes

Report on the research findings concerning trafficking of children in Russia in the framework of
the “Joint East West research project on trafficking”

“STELLIT”

SAINT-PETERSBURG NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATION

FOR SOCIAL PROJECTS

Edited by Muireann O’Briain

Saint-Petersburg, 2003

The Joint East West research project on trafficking in children for sexual purposes in Europe: the sending countries, has been co-financed by the European Commission STOP II programme and the OAK Foundation

Table of contents

Introduction	2
1. Research methodology	5
2. Russian legislation relating to child trafficking	8
3. The work of the law-enforcement authorities	16
4. Results of interviews	18
4.1. Children / adolescents	18
4.2. Russia as a sending country	22
4.3. Russia as a country of destination	31
4.4. Prevention strategies	34
4.5. Prevention programmes	36
4.6. Public awareness	37
5. Conclusions	38
6. Case studies	40
Bibliography	42

Introduction

Saint-Petersburg and the North-West of Russia are among the largest centres in the Russian Federation with a highly developed sex industry, which includes the commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC). CSEC takes different forms, and includes the involvement of children in prostitution, pornography, and trafficking (the importation of children from other regions of Russia and countries of the CIS, and the removal of children abroad for the purposes of sexual exploitation), as well as sexual services to tourists (mainly from the Scandinavian countries).

CSEC is not a new phenomenon in Russia. Researchers, writers and publicists in the 19th century described many incidents of the sexual exploitation of children, such as the sexual use of his peasants, including young girls, by a landowner under the conditions of serfdom. Another common tradition was where a member of the nobility lived with a girl from the middle or lower classes; many of these girls were sexually used before they had reached their majority. There were also brothels, including “high-class” brothels, mainly in Moscow and Saint-Petersburg, where children were kept for client use.

There are several periods during which the level of CSEC increased sharply during the history of modern Russia (20th and 21st centuries). It happened mostly in war, and during periods of social, economic, and political upheaval.

The years of the First World War and the Civil War (1914-1920), the year of the Revolution of 1917, and the economic collapse and famine that followed, were times during which thousands of children lost their parents. Some of these children turned to begging and theft, others to common labor. A widespread source of income was the sex industry.

The 1930s are characterized by strong political action in all spheres of life of the new Soviet state. The problems of child homelessness and the commercial sexual exploitation of children were solved in the same harsh way. All homeless children were forcibly placed in children’s homes that were organized on semi-military and semi-prison lines. After that, sexual exploitation and violence against children, child delinquency and drug abuse by children were not talked about at official level until the end of the 1980s. “Officially” these social problems did not exist in Soviet society.

Due to the official denial of the problem and to the strict system of social control over the lives of minors during the Soviet period it is impossible to be precise about the character of CSEC. However, some data about the existence of secret brothels "for the select few" allow us to conclude that CSEC was carried on under the Soviet regime.

The period of Perestroika, and later the change-over to market economics, saw the next stage in the increase of CSEC in Russia. This period is characterized by fundamental changes in all spheres of social life. Due to the social and political changes, the sexual behavior of Russians was liberalized. Victorian principles had dominated sexual mores during the Soviet period. The democratization of society saw the promotion of sexual enjoyment and of a variety of sexual practices, as well as a high demand for sexual services. Sex became a form of leisure. There was a sharp growth in the sex industry as a whole and in CSEC in particular. There was also a steep growth in the entertainment industry, related to the change-over to market economics, a growth of private industry, and changes in attitudes in society about spending free time outside the home and without the family. In addition, the political changes under Perestroika resulted in a serious increase in organized criminality and, correspondingly, in the sex industry, which is one of the traditional outlets for criminal activity.

The other reason for the increase of CSEC in the 1990s is the wide range of social problems affecting Russian society. The economic and political changes led to an increase in unemployment and poverty. During the years of reform, the real incomes of the population reduced by more than a half, and are still reducing. The fall in living standards affected the majority of the population. According to official statistics at the beginning of the 21st century, 30% of Russian citizens were considered poor (<http://demoscope.ru/weekly/011/tema02.php>). There are single-parent families and lonely elderly pensioners who are at particularly high risk of poverty. Women are largely represented in both categories of household. The situation is complicated by the vulnerable position of women in the labor market and the ineffective system of social support for poor families. The social services are only able to provide social support for 8-10% of the population which qualifies as poor. The social and economic exposure of women has also increased the market for sexual services.

Destruction of the system of government control which followed the economic recession in Russia, and which affected all spheres of life, caused serious changes in the social arena. First of all, it affected the position of the family and childhood. In Russia the number of families on low incomes, single-parent families, dysfunctional families, where the parents are alcohol or drug addicts, and families where family violence is common, constantly increases.

For the last decade, the families that cannot provide the basic necessities for bringing up and maintaining their children have steadily increased. There were 48,200 orders for the deprivation of parental rights in 2001, compared to 24,400 in 1997. In 2001 59,800 children¹ were taken

¹ At the beginning of 2002, the number of children under 18 in Russia was 31.6 million or 22% of the population (Periodical report on the Convention on the Rights of the Child submitted by the Russian Federation in 1998-2002, http://detirossii.narod.ru/Dok2konv.htm#_Toc26969791). The number of children in St. Petersburg at the beginning of 2002 was 878,700 (Support for the family

from their parents, whose parental rights were challenged on the grounds of violence, cruelty or neglect. (Periodical report on the Convention on the Rights of the Child submitted by the Russian Federation for the years 1998–2002, http://detirossii.narod.ru/Dok2konv.htm#_Toc26969791).

In Russia there are more and more orphans and children who have been taken from their parents. These amounted to 658,200 in 1999, 662,200 in 2000, 682,200 in 2001, 700,000 in 2002 (Official report “On the condition of children in the Russian Federation”/ Ministry of Labor and Social Development. Moscow: 2001, page 52).

Homeless children became a feature of everyday life and a symbol of post-Soviet Russia. According to official data there were 1 million homeless people at the beginning of 2002. At the same time, according to data from the General Office of the Public Prosecutor, published in the media and on TV, there are 2-2.5 million homeless people, whereas, according to estimates from the Council of the Federation of Independent Specialists (A. Arefyev, <http://demoscope.ru/weekly/2003/0113/tema01.php>), there are 3 to 4 million homeless in Russia. The main reasons that children leave their families are their difficult financial situation, alcohol abuse by parents, and violence against children. Cruelty towards children and adolescents leads to despair, depression, and to the children leaving their homes or educational institutions. In 2001 there were local or federal investigations launched concerning more than 43,900 missing children and adolescents; that is 11.2% more than in 2000. 41,200 minors (93.8% of those searched for), were found. Of these, 29,900 of them had left home, and 12,800 had left government institutions without permission (Periodical report on the Convention on the Rights of the Child prepared by the Russian Federation for the years 1998–2002, http://detirossii.narod.ru/Dok2konv.htm#_Toc26969791).

On the streets, children begin to use drugs, and to get involved in different kinds of criminal activity, including prostitution. During the last 5 years, 3,007 complaints were recorded about the involvement of minors in antisocial activities. In 2001 there were 418 such cases (Periodical report on the Convention on the Rights of the Child prepared by the Russian Federation for the years 1998–2002, http://detirossii.narod.ru/Dok2konv.htm#_Toc26969791).

Thus, the reasons for the growth in the sex industry as a whole, and CSEC in particular, are the changes in sexual culture, which has led to the growth of the entertainment industry and a demand for sexual services, an increase in the activity of organized criminal groups, including in the sex industry, and to the social and economic exposure of children. Together with child

prostitution, there is also sex tourism, child pornography and trafficking, all of which have become widespread forms of sexual exploitation in Russia.

Saint-Petersburg and the North-West of Russia are among largest centres of CSEC in the Russian Federation because of the high concentration of financial resources, including illegal transactions, and the developed contacts with foreign countries, especially Scandinavia. These factors formed the basis for the development of the international forms of CSEC, such as sex tourism and trafficking.

The North-West of Russia, and Saint-Petersburg in particular, is both a sending region and a region of destination, in so far as trafficking is concerned. There are currently a lot of Russian women involved in prostitution abroad. Stories about young women, who leave to work abroad and become involved in sexual exploitation, are becoming more and more widespread in the Russian mass media. As a rule, this type of story is covered in an ill-informed manner; it is published in the gutter press, discussed on talk-shows etc. and, as a result, the problem of trafficking is distorted in the public consciousness.

Russian researchers began to study the problem of trafficking in women quite recently. Information about methods of involvement, migration waves among the adult population, and its knowledge about trafficking, have been studied. The results are described in part in this report. Trafficking of children between Saint-Petersburg, the North-West of Russia and foreign countries, is a highly-organized form of CSEC at present. However, there is almost no public response and very little action on the part of the state for prevention, help and rehabilitation of the children who become the victims of trafficking. There is no research work in this area. The present research into the trafficking of children, carried out in the context of the international "Joint East West Research Project on Trafficking" is the first initiative of its kind.

1. Research methodology

The research into trafficking of children was carried out in Saint-Petersburg in May and June 2003 by the staff of the NGO "Stellit".

The objective of the research was to collect expert opinion on the problem of child trafficking. The target experts were specialists from different organizations who are working with the problem of child trafficking.

The method of semi-structured interview was used. The average duration of the interviews was one hour.

In order to examine the problem properly, the employees of law-enforcement authorities, and those of governmental and non-governmental institutions concerned with the social protection of the family and childhood, were questioned.

In the course of identifying experts on the question of trafficking of children, telephone discussions were held with some specialists working in the sphere of childhood and family protection. Private meetings were held occasionally. The snowball method of enquiry was also used: some experts suggested contacting other specialists that might know something about the problem.

Some of the specialists that we consulted refused to participate in the research, claiming a lack of knowledge about the subject, or that their organization did not deal with the problem. These included, in particular, the Commissioner on the Rights of the Child in Saint-Petersburg, a representative of the Federal Migration Service, a staff member of the Public Security Police Administration, 2 staff members of law-enforcement authorities, 2 heads of state orphanages, members of the staff of 4 public organizations working with children at risk, and a member of the staff of one of the women's crisis centres.

Their reasons for refusing can be explained in the following way:

The problem of CSEC is a hidden one, and is not discussed, either among specialists in child protection or in society as a whole. This is because of the impact of two social value systems in modern Russia: The "Soviet" pedagogical tradition, and traditional Orthodoxy. Discussion of sexuality is forbidden in both traditions. Sexual relationships are considered as something shameful and not to be spoken about. Moreover sexual relationships with children are "impossible". In this way it is easier not to identify CSEC as a problem, and to ignore the incidence of sexual abuse of children.

It is very typical for specialists from the city governmental and non-governmental institutions working with minors to conceal the incidents of sexual abuse of children in their care. For example, if an inmate of a children's home is involved in prostitution, and it becomes known to someone who does not work at that institution, then the management can be penalized (by denial of increment, or rebuke; some serious cases, where violence is involved, can result in dismissal and criminal charges).

Another reason that specialists refuse to discuss this problem, even if they are faced with an incident of child trafficking in their own sphere of activity, is the impossibility of taking effective measures for the rehabilitation of a child (due to the inadequacies in the legislation, the lack of financial resources to help children in need, the lack of experience in working with victims of trafficking, and so on).

The link between child trafficking and organized criminality is also a reason to conceal information (because the experts may fear for their lives and careers).

One of the difficult stages of the research was the identification of experts from the law-enforcement authorities who would agree to be interviewed. The main reason for their reluctance is the common attitude of the law-enforcement authorities towards the problem of CSEC. It is very difficult to prosecute CSEC cases because of the inadequacies in the Russian legislation in regulating and controlling this problem. That is why law-enforcement officials try not to take on such cases. Some also don't consider CSEC to be a problem.

The research covered interviews with 17 experts from different fields. There were 7 men and 10 women. One was an employee of the Office of the Public Prosecutor, 7 were specialists from governmental organizations for child protection, public health institutions, social service authorities and other institutions, 8 were specialists from different NGOs, 1 was a mass media specialist, who had worked previously in the Saint-Petersburg Department of Internal Affairs. Among them, 6 experts held executive positions, 4 were the heads of departments, and 6 were middle level executives. One of the experts is a former inmate of a children's home, who is currently a staff member of a public organization.

Five experts had knowledge about child trafficking, from their personal experiences of working with victims of trafficking. Some other experts had encountered the phenomenon while investigating cases concerning child trafficking, communicating with specialists from other organizations, analyzing the literature on the problem, or reading/hearing reports in the mass media.

In addition to the information that was acquired in the course of the research, the following materials were used in the preparation of the report:

- Publications addressing the problem of CSEC, addictive behavior of children, gender questions;
- Published statistics;
- Web-sites about the problem of CSEC;
- Research findings concerning the commercial sexual exploitation of women and children, carried out by the staff of "Stellit", in particular:

1. "Child prostitution in Saint-Petersburg" (Autumn 1999). The subjects of this project were minors who were drug addicts, and involved in prostitution. The research covered 32 minors, all involved in prostitution, and 2 pimps. Leader of the project – M.M. Rusakova.

2. "Child prostitution with foreigners as clients in North-West Russia" (April-June 2000). The project was developed on the basis of pilot research data from 1999 and supported by the

Information Office of the Nordic Council of Ministers in Saint-Petersburg. The research covered 81 experts, and 41 minors involved in prostitution. Leaders – I.N. Gurvitch, M.M. Rusakova.

3. “Prostitution involving minors in Saint-Petersburg” (September-October 2000). The research was undertaken in the context of the STOP-2 project. The research subjects were minors living in Saint-Petersburg. The research covered 15 experts, and 15 minors involved in prostitution. Leader – M.M. Rusakova.

4. Research on Russian women who had become the victims of trafficking in the USA (April-May 2000). The research was carried out at the request of and with financial support from the Coalition Against Trafficking in Women (CATW). The research subjects were Russian women who had become the victims of trafficking in USA. (Transported to the USA, became involved in prostitution there, and were later deported, or came back on their own, to Russia) – 28 persons. Leader – M.M. Rusakova.

On the whole, the outcomes in the report describe the situation in the North-West of Russia². They reflect the knowledge about child trafficking that the experts, living in Saint-Petersburg, have. These findings have the quality of personal conclusions. They are of a descriptive character and can not be equated with the whole of the Russian Federation³.

2. Russian legislation relating to child trafficking

Under Russian legislation a child (or a minor) is a person under 18 years of age.

The current criminal legislation in Russia is not so strong as to contain preventive measures against child trafficking.

In the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation the responsibility for trading in minors or making other deals concerning them is contained in Article 152. Trading in minors is punished by imprisonment for from 5 to 15 years.

Trading in minors is the purchase and sale of a minor by his/her parents, or by those who are responsible for his/her care, to another person for money, or making other deals concerning a minor in the form of delivery and control of him/her. The act of purchase and sale is considered

² The territory of the Russian Federation is divided into seven federal regions. The North-West federal region is the fourth largest region in Russia. Its area is 1,676,400 square km or 9.8% of the Russian territory. The North-West region consists of the Republic of Karelia, the Republic of Komi, Arhangelskaya, Vologodskaya, Kaliningradskaya, Leningradskaya, Murmanskaya, Novgorodskaya, Pskovskaya oblasts (administrative areas), and the autonomous region of Saint-Petersburg and Nenets. The centre of the North-West region is Saint-Petersburg. The population (1st January, 2002) is 14,282,900 people or 9.9% of the Russian population. 81.8% of the population lives in cities. This is the most urbanized federal region of the country.

³ The problem of child's trafficking has developed differently in the Russian regions. Thus, some of the regions are providers of children for trafficking to the urban centres (Moscow, Saint-Petersburg). The removal of children to Asian countries is highly developed in the Sibirski and Primorski regions. Research should be carried out in each region, especially in the border regions, to be able to present data that would be valid for all of Russia.

to be completed at the moment of delivery of the minor to the purchaser and the handing over of money.

This article also covers the illegal removal of a minor abroad or his/her illegal return. The illegal removal of minor abroad can happen, in the case of sale of a child, for example, by using fictitious documents, or by an adoption which follows the established procedures but is in fact a sale of a child. The illegal return of a minor from abroad pre-supposes that the removal of a child by parents or adoptive parents was made legally, and then a sale and purchase or other deal was made.

The agreement with a pregnant woman that she will deliver a child, when born, to other people and receive a payment, qualifies as an attempt at a crime.

Unfortunately, this article is very limited in its application. It is mentioned in the Comments to the Criminal Code that the subject of this crime is “a person, who controls and manipulates a minor. This can be parents, adoptive parents, tutors, or workers in medical or children’s institutions”. Thus, the definition of those who are responsible for the purchase and sale, or other deal concerning a minor, is not wide enough. The situation where a minor is sold by someone, who is not his/her parent or tutor, or by a middleman, is not covered.

Moreover, for a prosecution under Article 152 of the Criminal Code, it is necessary to prove an act of purchase and sale, i.e. the fact of a transfer of money to the seller.

The law-enforcement authorities must be able to prove the money transaction by means of video, witnesses, etc. A long and laborious work of investigation is necessary before an investigator would succeed in being at the right time and in the right place and be able to arrange everything so that he could collect incontrovertible evidence. The number of such cases that are discovered is very low because of the long and difficult process of investigation, and also because of the need for the provision of incontrovertible proofs. There is in fact no interest in pursuing these kinds of investigations.

Article 126 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation partly solves the problem, dealing with the responsibility for the kidnapping of a human being, which consists of unlawful deliberate actions, connected with the secret or open abduction of a human being, or abduction by means of deception, removing a person from his natural immediate surroundings, removal from a place of permanent or temporary residence, and further keeping that person somewhere else against his will. The article includes the kidnapping of minors. Kidnapping of a human being is punished by imprisonment for from 5 to 15 years.

Article 127 of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation deals with illegal deprivation of liberty. This crime is connected to the crime of kidnapping, but in contrast to kidnapping, this

crime is completed without the removal of a person from one place to another against his will.

The penalty under this article is imprisonment for a term of 4 to 8 years.

The subject-matter of Articles 126 and 127 of the Criminal Code is the capture, whether secret or open, or connected with deception, of a person. But trafficking includes situations in which there is no capture of a person. Mostly victims freely agree to leave a country, and don't suspect that they are being trafficked. Prosecutions for trafficking in people have never been instituted in Russia, because the actions do not correspond with the *corpus delicti* covered by the above-mentioned articles of the Code.

Trafficking of minors can also be connected with illegal adoption. Article 154 regulates illegal actions concerning the adoption and delivery of a child to another person. This article regulates cases of abuses, forgeries and other anti-social actions concerning the adoption of children and guardianship or trusteeship of children. The punishment is in the form of a fine. In case of repeated offences, the penalty is detention for six months.

In the case of an illegal presence of a child – a citizen of another country – in Russia, administrative measures apply, and the child is deported.

The Criminal Code of the Russian Federation establishes responsibility for crimes against a minor: rape, buggery, carried out by a person over the age of 18, with a person under the age of 14, and corruption of persons under the age of 14.⁴

Prostitution, whether by adults or minors, is a minor offence. Criminal penalties are provided for the organization and keeping of dens of prostitution (Art. 241), namely imprisonment for up to 5 years.

Article 151 of the Criminal Code – the involvement of minors in antisocial actions (including prostitution), establishes the penalty for a person who entices a minor into prostitution, in the form of imprisonment for up to 4 years.

Liability for pimping is introduced in the New Criminal Code of the Russian Federation on administrative offences (2001). Article 6.12 deals with earnings from prostitution, if this income is connected with the prostitution of another person.

In this way, Russian legislation formally establishes penalties for the involvement of children in the sex industry. It contains articles which, by implication, regulate trafficking: kidnapping, illegal removal abroad, illegal adoption and so on. However, there is no article that gives any definition of trafficking, including trafficking in children. *De jure* there is no such crime as “trafficking” in Russia.

At the same time, the following international documents on the protection of children against CSEC have been signed by the Russian Federation: UN Convention on the Rights of the Child,

1989; Stockholm Agenda for Action against the commercial sexual exploitation of children, 1996; UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, 2000; Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children, supplemental to the UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, 2000.

Draft Bill on the Prevention of Trafficking (2002)

It should be noted that the signing of the UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime was the stimulus for the development and consideration of a Bill “On the prevention of the trade in human beings” in Russia. In October of 2002 a Working Group was set up by the Legislative arm of the Duma of the Russian Federation. There are non-governmental organizations, governmental bodies and law-enforcement agencies, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and others taking part in the drafting of the bill.

The bill has ten chapters. In the first chapter, new concepts that don't yet exist in Russian legislation are introduced. They include: “recruitment”, “government of destination”, “government of origin”, “surrogate mother”, “exploitation”, “victim of the trade in human beings” and others. The definition of trafficking corresponds to the definition in the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children.⁵ In this chapter the principles for the prevention of the trade in human beings are set out. Among the most important principles are non-discrimination against the victims of human trafficking, mandatory penalties for traders, the creation of social partnership and cooperation with public organizations, and others.

The second chapter – “International cooperation on the part of the Russian Federation for the prevention of the trade in human beings” – defines the principles and norms for cooperation with foreign governments and their competent authorities, and with international organizations for the prevention of the trade in human beings.

In the third chapter, “On the organization of prevention measures against the trade in human beings” there is a list of authorities that are responsible for the prevention of such trade. It proposes the establishment of federal and regional interdepartmental commissions for the prevention of trade in human beings. However, the administrative authority for these

⁴ Under Russian legislation, 14 years is the age of consent to sexual relations.

⁵ *"Trafficking in persons" shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.*

commissions is not defined. The commission will most probably function under the President of the Russian Federation, following the example of other commissions, such as the Commission on Pardons and others.

The fourth chapter, “On the responsibility and limits of responsibility for actions concerned with the trade in human beings”, contains general statements about the penalties for organizing and operating a trade in human beings.

In the fifth chapter, “Subjects and forms of trade in human beings”, the parameters and criteria of certain actions which amount to such trade are enumerated and defined. They are: the use of physical and psychological violence or threat, falsification of documents, provision of false identification, debt bondage, forced labor, deception or abuse of authority, limitation of freedom to travel.

In the sixth chapter, “On prevention of trade in human beings”, measures for the prevention of such trade are outlined. They include: the distribution of information about this phenomenon among the population, the development of and support for initiatives providing social and economic opportunities for at-risk groups, and others.

The seventh chapter, “Special institutions responsible for prevention measures against the trade in human beings”, lists the types and functions of municipal organizations that can support the victims of such trade, and shows how these organizations will be financed.

In the eighth chapter, “On social rehabilitation and protection of the victims of the trade in human beings”, there is a list of documents that are necessary for providing help to the victims of such trade, and the duties of the organizations that must provide that help.

The ninth chapter, “Changes and additions to legislative acts of the Russia Federation”, establishes a system of amendments to existing provisions. Thus, there are seven new amendments proposed to the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation.

The work on the Bill is undoubtedly an important step toward the prevention of the trade in human beings. Among the advantages of the bill, the comprehensive approach to such trade should be noted. The bill pre-supposes that the solution to the problem lies not only in the work of the law-enforcement authorities, but in cooperation between different governmental agencies, including those working on the regulation of migration. Non-governmental organizations, employers, and the formation of public opinion are all important elements in the solution of this problem. In addition, the governmental agencies must cooperate with public organizations. In the context of the bill, the status of victims of trade in human beings is identified, not as criminals liable to deportation, but as victims, who need to be supported by the social system.

The defects in the bill are in its failure to identify the structures responsible for the prevention of the trade in human beings. Based on the principles of the Russian legal system, such structure

must first of all have a status in the criminal justice system, i.e. to be under the Ministry of Internal Affairs or the Federal Security Service, because the law-enforcement authorities institute criminal cases, investigate cases concerned with trafficking, and decide the penalties for those who organize human trafficking. The proposed commission dealing with the prevention of trafficking under the President of the Russian Federation will not have a criminal justice function. This means that there will be difficulties in the examination of such cases. The commission risks becoming an ineffective structure, and of being unable to solve the problem of trafficking.

The part dealing with the financing of organizations that are concerned with the rehabilitation of victims of the trade in human beings is not finished in the Bill. It is not clear who are to establish orphanages and refuges – the government, non-governmental organizations, individuals etc. At present the work on the bill is on-going. It must be pointed out that society is not very informed about the work on the bill.

Proposed amendments to the Criminal Code (2003)

At the beginning of November 2003, Russian President V.V. Putin introduced amendments to the Criminal Code relating to responsibility for the commercial sexual exploitation of human beings, namely human trafficking and related criminal activities, prostitution and pornography. If these amendments are adopted by the Duma,⁶ the new provisions in the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation will read as follows:

‘The following provisions of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation are supplemental to articles 126 and 127¹.

Article 127¹. Human trafficking.

1. Human trafficking, namely the purchase and sale for the purpose of exploitation, or other actions in the form of recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, is punished by imprisonment for up to 5 years.

2. The same action if committed:

- a) against two or more people;
- b) against a minor;
- c) by a person through the abuse of a position of authority;
- d) by means of the transfer of a victim across the State border of the Russian Federation or by means of the illegal detention of a person abroad;
- e) by the use of forged documents or by the deletion, concealment or destruction of a victim’s identity documents;

⁶ A review of the amendments to the Criminal Code is scheduled for the beginning of the period of office of the new State Duma.

f) by the use of violence or the threat of violence;

g) for the purpose of the removal of organs or tissues,

is subject to punishment by imprisonment for from 3 to 10 years.

3. If the actions provided for in the first or second parts of this article:

a) result in the death, or damage to the health, of a victim or other grievous consequences;

b) are committed by means that endanger the life and health of other people;

c) are committed by an organized group,

then the penalty is imprisonment for from 8 to 15 years.

Notes. 1. A first offender, who commits an offence provided for under the first part and clause 'a' of the second part of the above article, who voluntarily releases a trafficked victim and contributes to the disclosure of the crime will be discharged from criminal responsibility if there is no other charge against him.

2. In this article, the exploitation of a person shall mean the use of that person in prostitution by other people or other forms of sexual exploitation, slave labor or service, or the creation of a condition of dependency, as well as the removal of organs or tissues.

Article 127. Use of slave labor.

1. The use of person's labor by the exercise of a proprietary right over that person, who cannot exercise his own independent will to refuse to carry out the work, or provide the service, is punishable by imprisonment for up to five years.

2. The same action, if committed:

a) against two or more people;

b) against a minor;

c) by a person through the abuse of a position of authority;

d) by the use of blackmail, violence or the threat of violence;

e) by the deletion, concealment or destruction of a victim's identity documents,

is subject to punishment by imprisonment for from 3 to 10 years.

3. The actions provided for in the first and second parts of this article, if resulting in death, or damage to the health of a victim, or other serious harm, or if committed by an organized group, are liable to punishment by imprisonment for from 8 to 15 years'.

In the Criminal Code, a new article 242¹ would be incorporated to regulate the production and distribution of materials or objects containing pornographic images of minors:

'1. Production, storage or transfer across the State Border of the Russian Federation for the purpose of distribution, public presentation or advertisement, of materials or objects containing pornographic images of persons who appear to be minors, as well as the involvement of persons who

appear to be minors as performers in spectacles with pornographic content, with a person who is over the age of 18, is punishable by imprisonment for up to 6 years.

2. The same actions, if committed:

a) by a parent or other person charged with the upbringing of a minor, or by a teacher or other employee of an educational, child-care, medical, or other institution, or by a person responsible for the care of a minor;

b) against a person obviously under the age of 14;

c) by a group of people in pursuance of a previous agreement, or by an organized group, are punishable by imprisonment for from 3 to 8 years’.

In the new version of the Code, Articles 240 and 241 would read as follows:

‘Article 240. Involvement in prostitution.

1. Involvement in prostitution or coercion to prostitute is punishable by a fine of up to two hundred thousand roubles, or to a fine consisting of the rate of salary or other income of a convicted person for a period of up to 18 months, or by detention for up to 3 years, or imprisonment for the same period.

2. The same action, if committed:

a) by the use or threat of violence;

b) by transferring a victim across the State border of the Russian Federation or by the illegal detention of a person abroad;

c) by a group of people under an agreement with each other,

is punishable by imprisonment for up to 6 years.

3. The actions provided for in the first and second parts of this article, if committed by an organized group against someone who is obviously a minor, are punishable by imprisonment for from 3 to 8 years.

Article 241. Organization of prostitution.

1. Activities involving the organization of the prostitution of other people, as well as the maintenance of dens for prostitution or the systematic provision of premises for prostitution are punishable by a fine of from one hundred thousand to five hundred thousand roubles, or a fine consisting of 1 to 3 years salary or other income of the convicted person, or by detention for up to 5 years, or imprisonment for the same period.

2. The same actions, if committed:

a) by a person who abuses a position of authority;

b) by the use of violence or the threat of violence;

c) by involving minors in prostitution,

are punishable by imprisonment for up to 6 years.

3. The actions provided for in the first and second parts of this article, if committed using persons obviously under the age of 14 for prostitution, are punishable by imprisonment for from 3 to 10 years’.

In article 151, on «involvement of a minor in anti-social activities», his/her involvement in prostitution is deleted. Article 152 is proposed to be deleted from the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation.

All in all, these articles are designed to regulate criminal and legal liability for such phenomena as the trafficking of under-aged persons, the production and distribution of materials and objects with pornographic images of under-aged persons, the involvement of minors in prostitution, and organization of the prostitution of minors. As mentioned above, these amendments to the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation have not yet been adopted, but have been presented for the consideration of the State Duma. These amendments are a significant step towards providing a legal basis of responsibility in relation to crimes of commercial sexual exploitation, including such crimes against children.

3. The work of the law-enforcement authorities

Most of the operative articles of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation mentioned above and other pieces of legislation concerning commercial sexual exploitation and trafficking are in fact not used in law-enforcement practice. Statistics show that 74 crimes under Art. 152 were recorded in 1997 in the Russian Federation, 35 such crimes in 1998, 28 in 1999, and 37 in the year 2000. Correspondingly 45, 49, 30 and 8 people were made answerable for such crimes. (M. Kleiminov, S. Shamkov. Trafficking of people: possibilities for counteraction. Trade in people, socio-criminological analysis. Under the editorship of Y.V. Turukanova and L.D. Erohina. Moscow: Academia, 2002, page 113.)

In Saint-Petersburg from the beginning of 1995 until now there were only 2 crimes recorded under Art. 152 (trade of children) in 1998, and 2 cases under Art. 154 (illegal actions concerning adoption) in the years 1998 and 2000.⁷

Most experts consider that the current legislation of the Russian Federation is imperfect, and contains many contradictions.

Most experts noted the (current) absence of legislation concerning both adult and child trafficking. They took the view that Article 152 does not work. Only cases concerning new-born children were instituted under this article. The experts don’t know of any incident involving the

⁷ Information provided by the Department of Internal Affairs of Saint-Petersburg and Leningradskaya oblast in August 2003.

removal of a new-born child abroad. In their opinion, it is impossible to prove such crimes because of the difficulties connected with the collection of information from abroad, and with the collection of evidence and relevant documents.

One more reason that the problem of child trafficking is not given priority is the absence of a special department working on cases concerned with trafficking.

In the opinion of four experts, there is also an absence of legislation concerning the protection and rehabilitation of victims that were involved in prostitution, were sold, removed abroad, and later returned to Russia.

The lack of willingness and the difficulties on the part of the law-enforcement authorities to work on the issue is related by the experts to the inadequacies in the article covering the trafficking of minors, and to the lack of practical experience in this field.

According to the crime statistics, the percentage of crimes uncovered in Russia is very high (above 90%). However, the information provided by the law-enforcement authorities relates to the absolute index of crime discovery. So no enquiry is instituted in relation to those criminal cases that are difficult to investigate, and the complaints of the victims of such crimes are not recorded. The militia is not interested in investigating such cases, and demand that complainants withdraw their complaint. The situation is complicated by the fact that people do not trust the law-enforcement authorities, there is very little knowledge about legislation, and people do not have the money to seek qualified legal help.

If a child, who was a victim of trafficking, returns to Russia, he/she cannot apply independently to the law-enforcement authorities to have his/her case examined. Only a legal representative of the child (parent, tutor or other), or a representative of the authority responsible for the guardianship of children, can apply with such a request to the law-enforcement authorities. But in fact the experts did not know of any occasion on which such an application had been made. In their opinion, there are no such applications at all, or they are simply not recorded by the law-enforcement authorities. This is why the experts do not know of any case of a child returning to Russia: there is simply no information.

The second reason why the law-enforcement authorities are unwilling to work on the issue is because they do not consider it to be important, and think that there are very few cases of child trafficking.

“I think when being asked about this nonsense (trafficking) the law-enforcement authorities will always say that this problem is not large; there are only a few isolated instances.” (I.Sh., former employee of the Department of Internal Affairs).

Such opinion is widespread in society, and colors attitudes to all forms of CSEC. In Russian society, people involved in the sex industry are poorly regarded and treated as “different”.

Besides, a significant number of the children that are sexually abused in Russia are children from marginalised families or are “street” children. There are only a few people interested in their destinies. So the militia does not get any pressure from the public, the victims, or the authorities to undertake the investigation of such cases.

The third reason for the lack of law-enforcement practice in CSEC prevention is the corruptibility of some officials at different levels of authority, their connection with organized criminality, and, as a result, their economic interest in supporting trafficking.

In this way there is no adequate legislative base for dealing with child trafficking at present in Russia. In relation to the articles that can be used against traffickers, the main problem is the lack of implementation of the laws and the lack of expertise in cases of child trafficking. It appears impossible that such cases would be pursued unless the law-enforcement authorities give them some priority, and unless there is pressure from the public.

4. Results of interviews

4.1 Children / adolescents

All experts defined a child as a person under the age of 18. At the same time, most of the experts are inclined to divide the concept of ‘child’ into a child or juvenile (a person under 14) and adolescent (a person between 14-17 years of age). The experts, in determining the meaning of ‘child’ also refer to the level of intellectual and physical development of a child.

“We can give two definitions. From the juridical point of view we don’t have the concept of “child” but rather that of “minor”. So a child is a person under 18. But on the other hand if criminal responsibility begins at 14 years of age, then a child is a person under 14 in law. In this way a person under 14 is not old enough to live independently and needs to be under someone’s guardianship” (I.Sh., former employee of the Department of Internal Affairs).

The experts found it difficult to provide a definition of trafficking. Only one of the experts (from the legal profession) gave a definition of trafficking by reference to the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children under the UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime.

Others defined child trafficking in the context of slavery, trade in human beings, purchase and sale, removal for the purpose of prostitution, pornography, labor. *“Trafficking is the use of a child, when a child is the subject of purchase and sale, when he is taken abroad without his agreement. It is difficult for me to explain it” (N.A., Psychologist).* The experts mentioned trafficking in relation to the crossing of borders and also internal trafficking.

In the opinion of all the experts there are no precise and reliable statistics on the question of the trade in human beings in Russia at present. Not one expert could name even an approximate number of children who have become the victims of trafficking. This can be explained in the following way:

First of all, child trafficking is a hidden phenomenon, in view of the activities of organized criminal groups and the “taboo” on public discussion of CSEC. Secondly, the problem of trafficking is not considered important at government level. The transnational trade in women and children is not a new kind of crime in Russia,⁸ though, due to globalization, these crimes have a new, transnational, dimension. However, public awareness and legislation do not change quickly in Russia. So data concerning the trade in human beings is not collected at government level because there is no tradition of relevant data collection. Besides, most of those who have been sold are not considered by immigration authorities as the “victims” of trade but rather as persons who have breached the passport and visa regulations.

Undoubtedly, trafficking in women is more widespread and better understood than child trafficking. *“It is difficult to remove a child because our legislation controls the adoption process to some extent. And it is also very expensive. It is easier to deal with adult girls, because only their agreement is needed”* (N.A., Psychologist).

The experts don’t know of any research into trafficking of children done in Russia. Only the migration waves of the female population of Saint-Petersburg, including minor girls of the ages of 16 – 17 were studied. The potential risk groups for trafficking were defined in research by the Institute on Equality in gender relationships.⁹ The research showed that earlier ideas about the victims of trafficking were that these were the inhabitants of small towns or settlements, from poor, uneducated or dysfunctional families, or marginalised women. Yet potential victims of trafficking are representative of many different groups. However, all of them lack knowledge and underestimate their own vulnerability. Everyone is at risk. So the preventive actions must cover as many different age and social groups of women as possible. The prevention programmes must be carried out on three levels at the same time: through the mass media, to provide key information about the problem of trafficking; in the form of lectures for small groups of different ages and social status; and at the individual level for migrants who have access to some resources through help lines or counseling services.

In the opinion of the experts, the potential victims of trafficking are mainly girls over 14 years of age. These are both children from the big cities of Russia and children from settlements, villages

⁸ The problem of trafficking was widely discussed in the end of the 19th and beginning of the 20th centuries, when the trafficking of girls and women from the regions of Russia, and from Poland, Germany, and the Baltic to the city brothels (Moscow and Saint-Petersburg) was widespread.

⁹ Women’s Crisis Centre, 2000.

and small towns. Experts do not consider boys to be at risk of being trafficked abroad. Most likely boys become the victims of internal trafficking or are trafficked within the CIS countries. In this connection it is necessary to say a few words about the sexual exploitation of minor boys. Information about the sexual exploitation of boys is even more hidden than information about the sexual exploitation of girls. The reasons are that, firstly, there is a very negative attitude in society towards homosexuality. Homosexuals are stigmatized and suffer discrimination. That is why adolescent boys, involved in homosexual prostitution, are exposed to double stigmatization: both as homosexuals and as prostitutes. Hence we can suppose that organizations tend not to work with boys involved in CSEC, because of the complex nature of the problem, and the scandal associated with it.

However, the research into CSEC in the region of Saint-Petersburg and North-West Russia, carried out by the staff of the St. Petersburg NGO “Stellit”, shows that the involvement of boys in the sex business is widespread. This form of sexual abuse is better organized and controlled because of the higher level of income related to it (due to the specificity of clients – according to the boys themselves, many wealthy and well-known men and also foreigners are clients), and therefore it is a more hidden kind of prostitution, than the prostitution of girls. The boys involved in homosexual prostitution in Saint-Petersburg are mainly from the suburbs.

Evidently, boys can also become the victims of trafficking. For example, we have information about the existence about a brothel in Finland in 2000-2001 to where children, including boys, were taken from Saint-Petersburg.¹⁰ So the trafficking of boys exists, but there is practically no information about it.

It is possible to name the following **categories of children who are potential victims of trafficking:**

1. ***Children from dysfunctional families*** who leave their families and spend most of their time on the street. Often these are single-parent families, or families where the parents are alcoholics, or families in which the children are subjected to physical and sexual violence.

“These are most often the children from marginalised families, i.e. where there is only one mother with constantly changing lovers. These are the children that experience sexual violence, the children that are exposed to different addictions – drug, alcohol abuse and so on” (G.V., Principal of orphanage).

Children who spend much of their time on the street, without parental control, are liable to be involved in drug abuse, begging and prostitution.

¹⁰ A boy, involved in homosexual prostitution in Saint-Petersburg, informed us about it (during 2001 he worked around the area of Catherine’s Garden in the centre of the city.).

2. **Children, living and working on the street.** Living on the street, children work as beggars, loaders at markets, etc. They can also be involved in dealing, including the trade in stolen goods and drugs.¹¹ In addition, such children are often involved in the sex industry and used for pornography. These children are, as a rule, not noticed by the ordinary citizens: a dirty, threadbare child, asking for money near the underground stations does not attract attention. Their parents (tutors) ignore their existence. So if such children become the victims of trafficking, no one will care.

3. **Minor girls, working as models,** participating in beauty contests, wanting to work in show business. The modeling business is well developed in Russia. The profession of model is prestigious and highly-paid. Modeling schools, and schools of acting in cities welcome children of different ages. In Russia there are more than 2,500 model agencies, casting agencies, theatre-schools, fashion houses, where about 125,000 models work. The large centres for the modeling business are Moscow, Saint-Petersburg, Rostov-on-Don, Nizhni Novgorod, Kazan, Voronezh, Samara, Yekaterinburg, Saratov, Perm, Novosibirsk. There are 75 model agencies and 30 child model schools in Moscow (<http://www.diamant-casting.ru/club/>).

Often these agencies promise a job-placement, participation in fashion shows, etc. In most cases these promises are not fulfilled. Some agencies propose work abroad that can become a form of removal abroad for the purpose of sexual exploitation.¹²

4. **Minor girls,** who want to change their financial situation by leaving for another country, marriage with a foreigner, etc. In modern Russia the idea of living abroad doesn't correspond to reality. Myths about successful lifestyles in Europe are widespread. The results of research into girls' attitudes towards the problems of migration and trafficking, done by the staff of the St. Petersburg NGO "Stellit"¹³ showed that more than half the girls think that foreigners rate Russian women highly as wives. More than one third of the girls have thought about the possibility of marrying a foreigner and going abroad as a real opportunity to solve financial problems. The girls can look for a foreign husband by applying to marriage agencies and using the Internet.

5. **Child-orphans,** living in children's homes or other institutions. Very often these children are handicapped, and have limited opportunities. One of the experts thinks that new-born children that are in children's homes can be sold by the staff of these organizations. These

¹¹ Analysis of the position of working street children in Saint-Petersburg. ILO office in Moscow, St. Petersburg, 2000.

¹² In the course of the research of trafficking in women to the USA in 2000, this way of removal was documented.

¹³ The research into the attitudes of girls to the problem of trafficking and the possibility of migration abroad was carried out in January, 2003 by the St. Petersburg NGO "Stellit". The method of asking questions was used. The research was targeted at schoolgirls of three ten-classes and three eleven-classes from the secondary schools of Saint-Petersburg. A total of 60 persons were questioned.

children have not been registered, and so it is really easy to sell them. According to the experts, the staff of such organizations can also assist in the removal of children.

6. ***Children who have graduated from children's homes***, and who are not prepared for the conditions of independent living. Due to the system of closed pedagogical institutions in Russia, their inmates are not prepared for an independent life. Under the influence of the harsh, strict and "hothouse" conditions which provide them with shelter, nutrition and clothes at the expense of the state, many of them begin independent life without being ready for self-reliance. They had been used to being given everything without exerting themselves. A lot of the former inmates of child institutions have a consumerist attitude to life. Having graduated, they expect to be provided with a place to live and a certain sum of money by the government. The staff of these institutions can take advantage of them.

A girl, 17 years old, a graduate of a children's home. After beginning her independent life she faced difficulties with finances, a place to live and finding a job. She was raped by members of the militia. She didn't plan to prostitute, but she was forced to by her life conditions. Soon she met someone who took her to Israel (by this time she had attained her majority). (L.V., Psychologist).

7. ***Child refugees from countries where local wars are taking place***. As a rule, the families of refugees don't have a place to live and money at the new place. They have to turn to begging and prostitution. The children spend much of their time on the street, working also as beggars. In such situations there is a very high risk of becoming involved in prostitution, pornography and trafficking.

In this way, the "at-risk" group for becoming the victims of trafficking in minors includes rather a wide range of children. The children can be from different social groups, different occupations, have different aspirations, etc. Such conclusions disprove the myth that is widespread in society, and among some specialists, that the potential victims of commercial sexual exploitation and trafficking are only the children from dysfunctional families and orphans. This information should be put to practical use in planning prevention measures and in changing public opinion.

4.2 Russia as a sending country

The experts have different opinions about Russia as a sending or a receiving/ transit country. Whether Russia is seen as a destination country or as a sending country depends on the profile of the expert in question, and his personal experience of working with victims of trafficking. Seven experts think that Russia is both a sending and a receiving country. These include several workers from women's crisis centres and those who participate in the network for the prevention

of trafficking. As a rule, they work in organizations that are concerned with prevention and the rehabilitation of victims of trafficking.

Four experts think that Russia, in particular the North-West of Russia, is only a receiving country and a region where internal trafficking takes place; these respondents represent law-enforcement authorities and orphanages. It is quite possible that their attitudes are formed by the activity the expert is involved in (for example, workers from orphanages and law-enforcement officials often work with children who are illegal migrants in Russia).

The countries of destination, where the children are sent from Russia, are in Western Europe, in particular Germany, Italy, Cyprus, Denmark, France and Sweden. Russian minors can be removed through the countries of the former USSR (for example through Ukraine, Belarus, Moldova) to the above-mentioned countries. The USA, China, Korea, Japan, Israel and Turkey were also mentioned as countries of destination.

Most experts consider that these countries are first of all the destination countries for trafficking in Russian women for the purpose of sexual exploitation.¹⁴ However the same channels used for the removal of women can also be used for the removal of children.

It is possible to list the following **ways of recruiting of children for the purpose of trafficking to foreign countries:**

1. Suggestions from friends or acquaintances to go working abroad / to Russia as a dancer, servant, nurse and so on. Sometimes the woman who suggests the work will have been a victim of trafficking herself (“second wave”).
Suggestions to a child can be made by acquaintances on the street and also by people that the child trusts. One of the experts – a member of staff of a government shelter for girls in Saint-Petersburg described an incident where a woman – a school-teacher proposed to her pupils that they would go abroad to work as dancers.
2. Proposals to work abroad in show-business (beauty contests, recruitment to modeling schools, etc.).
3. Marriage advertisements or suggestions from acquaintances to go abroad for the purpose of marriage or to meet a potential husband.
4. Advertisements proposing work in the service industry abroad (work in bars etc.).
5. Parents, who come to an agreement with a purchaser and sell their child to traffickers.
6. Proposals for exchange programmes and education of students.

¹⁴ See sources in bibliography № 5, 6, 9, 13, 15, 16.

The experts described the following **ways for taking children abroad**:

1. With counterfeit documents. Forged passports are made most often for girls under 14. The experts note that falsification of documents in Russia is widespread and is not difficult. In Russia a forged passport for a girl under 14 can be obtained for an 800 USD bribe.¹⁵ For example, the real-life heroine of the film "Lilja 4ever" was taken to Sweden to work in the sex industry on a forged passport.

“It is very easy to forge documents. It doesn’t take a great effort, moreover, the practice of stealing documents to leave the country is widespread” (I.Sh., former employee of the Department of Internal Affairs).

2. An adult takes a child abroad and comes back without him.

In 1996 a Russian woman took two little orphans abroad: a boy of 8 years and a girl of 11 years. No adoption took place. The woman came back alone. The location of the children was not discovered. In the course of the criminal investigation the fact of the illegal removal of the minors was established. But this case has still not come to court. (S.A., Lawyer).

The removal of a minor abroad is regulated under the Federal law “About leaving the Russian Federation and entering the Russian Federation” (1996), and also under its amending law of 2003.

Removal from and entry to the Russian Federation take place on foot of documents that certify a person as a Russian citizen beyond the borders of the Federation (passport). A minor gets a passport by means of a written application from one or both parents, tutors, guardians or carers. In the Russian Federation persons aged 14 and upwards can get a passport. Under this age, the data about the child is recorded on the passports of the parents. The child’s photo is attached to the passport of the adult, but only when he has reached 6 years of age. In this way it is possible to remove any child up to the age of 6 years.

According to Article 20 of the 1996 Federal law, a minor citizen of the Russian Federation must leave the Federation together with at least one parent, tutor, guardian or carer. If a minor leaves Russia alone he must produce the notarised agreement of one of the above-mentioned persons in addition to a passport.

According to Article 21, in case one of the parents, tutors, guardians or carers opposes the removal of a minor abroad, the question of his removal will be resolved by court proceedings. The removal abroad of a child by one of the parents without the agreement of the other happens very seldom in Russia. Every such incident is subjected to court examination. Points of disagreement with some countries (USA, Canada, Australia, Sweden, Finland) are solved on a

¹⁵ Sinicin F.L. International legislation concerning the problem of trafficking in people. Perm, 2000.p. 4

bilateral basis in the framework of existent intergovernmental agreements (Periodical report on the Convention on the Rights of the Child submitted by the Russian Federation for the period 1998–2002, (http://detirossii.narod.ru/Dok2konv.htm#_Toc26969791)).

In Article 22 the responsibility for the life and health of minor citizens of the Russian Federation who go abroad is placed on their parents, tutors, guardians or carers. In cases where there is an organised group of minor citizens of the Federation leaving without their parents, tutors, guardians or carers, the persons in charge of such group takes on the responsibilities of legal representative of the minors.

3. By means of adoption of a child by a foreigner

In Russia all data about children without parental care are collected on the government database for such children. The Federal law of 16.04.2001 “On the governmental database of children deprived of parental care” came into effect on 19th October 2001. According to the law, information about children without parental care can be made public to the Russian population through the mass media or in any other way.

The legal basis for adoption of Russian children by foreigners is set out in Article 165 of the Family Code. According to this article the adoption of a child, who is a citizen of the Russian Federation, by foreign citizens is permitted if it is not possible to arrange for adoption or guardianship by citizens of the Russian Federation. In other words, priority is given to Russian families.

According to Resolution №268 of the Russian Federation of 28.03.2000 “On the activities of authorities and organizations of foreign countries on the adoption of children on Russian soil and control over such adoption”, the adoption of children from Russia must be done through adoption agencies from foreign countries which have been properly accredited in Russia. In March 2002 in the Russian Federation there were 63 accredited representations of foreign adoption agencies, including 50 from the USA, 5 from Canada, 2 from Belgium, 2 from Italy, and 1 organization each for Finland, Spain, Sweden and France. By means of this Resolution, mechanisms for the control over the removal of Russian children abroad were established through accredited agencies. The representatives of the foreign agencies send written reports to the authorities of the Russian Federation about the living conditions and upbringing of the child in the family of the adoptive parents; these reports are prepared by the competent government authority in the country in which the child is living. In the first year reports are sent every 6 months, and during the second and the third years a report is sent once a year. (Periodical report on the Convention on the Rights of the Child submitted by the Russian Federation for 1998–2002, http://detirossii.narod.ru/Dok2konv.htm#_Toc26969791).

To adopt a child who has reached the age of 10, it is necessary to have his/her agreement to the adoption.

The number of children adopted by foreigners remains quite stable (5,604 children in 1998, 5,777 children in 2001), which is 22–25% of all adoptions in Russia; or 42–43% of all adoptions of Russian children by foreign citizens (Periodical report on the Convention on the Rights of the Child submitted by the Russian Federation for the period 1998–2002, http://detirossii.narod.ru/Dok2konv.htm#_Toc26969791).

According to the periodical report on the Convention on the Rights of the Child submitted by the Russian Federation for the period 1998–2002, there was no incident involving the exploitation of a child after his adoption abroad by foreigners. There is no evidence of the removal of Russian children abroad for economic exploitation (illegal work on construction sites, factories, farms, etc.). At the same time there are incidents of sexual exploitation of Russian minors abroad. The usual way in which they were removed was by means of tourist visas. Breaking the law in the matter of international adoption in the Russian Federation is more to do with internal corruption, namely bribery of officials by foreign citizens, who wish to adopt a Russian child. (Periodical report on the Convention on the Rights of the Child submitted by the Russian Federation for the period 1998–2002, http://detirossii.narod.ru/Dok2konv.htm#_Toc26969791).

But there are more and more incidents of illegal adoption of a Russian child by foreigners.

Frequently it is more difficult for Russians to adopt a child than it is for foreigners. The reason is that foreigners must pay to adopt. The money must be channeled through the Government Centre for Adoption and Guardianship. In the opinion of some experts, adoption orders sometimes break all legislative norms.

Thus in Saint-Petersburg all cases concerning adoption have to be examined by the Government Centre for Adoption and Guardianship. However, three experts gave examples of incidents in which the heads of children's homes made contact directly with potential foreign families. The families that applied to adopt a child paid the heads of these institutions.

The experts are not against the adoption of Russian children by foreign citizens. Often it is better for the child to leave Russia and live abroad. But the experts also think that sometimes the children are removed abroad to be used in the personal interests of the adopters.

One of the experts (I.M., Head of a shelter) gave details about an incident that happened in Volgograd as a case in point:

N., a former citizen of Russia was arrested in 2000. From 1993 she had represented the interests of an Italian association, A., which specialized in the adoption of orphans. She took an active part in the removal of Russian children abroad from Volgograd. The staff of the Federal Security Service of the Volgograd region established that many

documents necessary for the adoption of the Russian children and their removal abroad were fictitious.

The court found N. guilty of the falsification of documents and of bribing officials. The other accused, who were the head physician of a children's home, the former principal of the Volgograd children's home, and a former local committee specialist on education, were found guilty of taking bribes from N. to assist her in the adoption process. All of them were sentenced to seven years probation.

According to the data of the law-enforcement authorities from 1993 to January 2001, more than 500 children were removed from the Volgograd region. In the opinion of the experts, many of these children were not to be found at the addresses of their supposed adoptive families.

4. By means of marriage of a Russian woman with children to a foreigner

Two experts described marriage also as a way of trafficking, when a Russian woman, who has children, marries a foreigner, who intends to sexually exploit her children.

In 2000 a Russian woman, who had been living in Germany for a long time, called the Saint-Petersburg Women's Crisis Centre. She worked with foreigners, who came to live in Germany, and helped them to settle in. She told the Centre about a Russian woman who had married a German citizen. The woman had two children, aged 10 and 13. Her husband began to sexually abuse her children. The situation was that the woman depended legally and economically on her husband. She did not want to report this incident. She was afraid of being deported. She had no social security in Germany. She didn't want to go back to Russia.

In the opinion of the woman who called the centre, these kinds of incidents occur very often in Germany. These are cases where foreigners deliberately marry women who have children in order to get access to the children. (L.V., psychologist).

5. Surrogate motherhood

The female body is used for child-bearing and birth. After being born a child can be sold for adoption or other purposes. It is quite common for a woman to go abroad, give birth to a child and then return to her native country. In view of the economic difficulties in Russia, many women use the strategy of going abroad prior to the birth of a child for the purpose of earning what is a lot of money compared to the standard of living in Russia. An expert cited the following incident:

In December of 1998 the General Office of the Public Prosecutor of the Russian Federation received an application from the Department of Justice of the USA with a request to assist in a case where a Russian man, a Russian woman and an American woman were involved.

From the beginning of 1994, pregnant Russian women began to arrive in one of states of the USA to give birth and then to release their parental rights to allow the children to be adopted by American families.

There was one organization which was involved with adoption procedures in the USA. The head of the agency was an American woman who ran the operation, together with a Russian couple – a woman and a man. This group offered the opportunity to Russian women to leave Russia for the USA by providing false invitations that were used to get visas, or by forging visas. As a result of their operations in the USA, 50 pregnant Russian women came to the USA (from Moscow, Saint-Petersburg, the region around Moscow and other regions of Russia).

The group developed the following strategy:

The Americans provided the invitations for each pregnant woman, requesting permission for her to enter the USA to take part in an IT workshop, which was to be held by a non-existent company. The woman was granted the visa. She came to the USA, where she was met by the staff of the American agency. After giving birth she released her parental rights in favor of the agency, which then placed the child with an American family. After the woman had signed all the necessary documents she was paid 1000 USD. The adoptive family covered all the costs of the agency. After being paid for the adoption, the agency deposited 15,000 USD in various banks in Russia and Germany (P.S., Deputy Public Prosecutor).

6. Participation in international exchange and education programmes.

The business and educational contacts taking place during the past years between Russian and foreign educational institutions are undoubtedly a positive consequence of the social and political changes in Russia. Pupils and students have the chance to get into courses or work experience in foreign colleges, universities and companies, resulting in an exchange of mutual experience and knowledge. However the international exchange programmes, which enable people to go abroad, can also be used by traffickers as a channel through which to remove both minors and adults.

In 1999 the Administration of one of the St. Petersburg colleges contracted with an agency that selected foreign educational institutions for training Russian female

students in Germany. Arrived at the training place, the students were terrified to realize that they had been brought to a brothel. Fortunately they had return tickets and they managed to get back to Russia (N. Anisimova, Slavery. St.Petersburg vedomosti. 14 April 2000).

Organization of trafficking

Trafficking is a criminal operation, in which members of organized criminal gangs, and even staff of the law-enforcement authorities, the migration service, and the customs service are involved. The established networks which take minors out of the country involve the participation of all these services. It should be noted that there is a direct connection with weapon and drugs trafficking. If there are channels operating to take people out of the country, the same channels can be used to move weapons and drugs.

“These are the same operations, and the reason they work is - contacts. I do not have such contacts, so I am not able to take someone out of the country using forged documents, or to traffic drugs. A person who has such contacts in the customs service and the consulate won't be satisfied with the income from prostitution. He will deal in weapons and drugs, and in this connection he needs money to purchase weapons, drugs, forged documents and airplane tickets“. (V.K., Psychologist).

Moreover, there is a direct connection between the local sex industry, including CSEC, and the use of children for pornography and sex tourism, and child trafficking. It is conditioned by the fact that it is the same people who are involved with such activities.

The experts believe that anyone can organize the trafficking of children abroad. It is impossible to limit it by nationality or gender. The following are the participants in a trafficking operation: recruiters, sellers, purchasers in western countries and those who conceal a trafficking operation. As a rule, the recruiter and the seller work in pairs. Characteristically, such pair will include a man, who is a foreigner and his wife, who is Russian. She recruits the children, and her husband sells them.

Women who themselves were trafficked by deception often become involved themselves in recruitment.

As for trafficking through the use of modeling agencies and employment agencies, the system works according to the following example. Russian men and women recruit the children independently, or as the operatives of some agencies. Having arrived, the girls are met by Russian operatives. A foreign impresario, who will have direct connections with Russia, will

have a file on the girls, including their photos. He distributes the information among the owners of brothels, cabarets, etc. After the girl has arrived from Russia, she is placed in some establishment that is usually a strip club or a secret brothel.

Two experts noted that the traffickers who recruit and sell children abroad don't, as a rule, have large incomes, in contrast to the purchaser. He runs the brothels and prostitution dens in the foreign country where the children are placed. Usually when children are sold, it is on foot of a specific request from such purchaser.

"I can see the situation from the descriptions given by the victims. It is those, who run the brothels and dens, and who possibly trade in drugs at the same time, who have the largest incomes." (M.S., Jurist).

Experts have different opinions concerning the location of children. On the one hand a child can be kept at a separate apartment because "There is a market, and he costs more. Clients receive him in their houses". (G.V., Head of an orphanage). On the other hand, it is easier to control children when they are kept together in a common apartment. In this way, children can also be kept in secret brothels. The brothels look like an apartment which is divided by screens into small rooms.

"These are the secret brothels. It is unprofitable to use a single flat as a brothel. To make big money there have to be many people... The apartments consist of several small rooms. Everything is within earshot, so everything can be easily controlled. You can control one apartment for the equivalent of ten flats in one place." (V.K., Psychologist).

As a rule, control over the children and also the search for clients is done by a pimp. He watches over the child's health and provides him with food and clothes.

Experts described the following control mechanisms used by the pimps:

- intimidation by means of physical or psychological violence,
- getting the child hooked on drugs,
- controlling the minor by dealing out "kind" or "strict" treatment. If a child has been brought up in conditions of violence, then when he is somehow taken care of, it gives him the feeling that he is being protected. His feelings can be manipulated.

Clients

Clients of minors can be divided into two categories. The first category includes paedophiles. Such persons were described by the expert as "*Womanlike and weak. Probably, his mother was a cruel woman, who put pressure upon him. So he finds fulfillment by putting pressure on a child, i.e. by being violent towards him*" (G.V., Head of an orphanage).

The second category consists of those consumers who use a minor without attention to his age. Minor adolescents, especially girls, often look like an adult person, so the client is primarily concerned with the minor's appearance.

According to the opinion of the experts, most clients that sexually use children in foreign countries are middle-aged men.

It is difficult to give estimates of the costs of using children for sexual services. The experts consider that it depends on the particular type of service. So sexual contact with a child under the age of 12 costs more than with a minor who is older than 12. The same is true about the prostitution of boys; it is more specialized, and so costs more than the prostitution of girls.

4.3 Russia as a country of destination

Besides being a country from which children are removed, Russia (the North-West of Russia in particular) is also a country which imports children for the purposes of using them as cheap labor as well as for commercial sexual exploitation. The children are removed either from the countries of the former CIS (Moldova, Belarus, Ukraine, Kazakhstan) or within Russia itself.

In the opinion of experts, *internal trafficking* is widespread in Russia. The children are removed from small towns of the central regions, the Urals and Siberia, to bigger cities. The 'receiving' cities are, first of all, Moscow and Saint-Petersburg, but sometimes are also the cities situated at the intersection of big highways which are industrial centres (in particular, Tolyatti was mentioned).

There are millions of migrants from the nearby settlements, the Russian regions and the CIS countries, who live illegally in the large cultural and economic centres such as Moscow, Saint-Petersburg and others. Thus, for example, migrants make up about 80% of the women involved in street prostitution in Saint-Petersburg.

There are also many children among the migrants. Most children who leave their families or educational institutions want to come to the large centres because it is easier to survive on the streets there: it is easier to avoid the control of the law-enforcement authorities or the social protection services. There is a certain community on the streets, and a child, having come into it, gets access to places to find a night's lodging, ways of earning some money, and so on. The basements of houses, deserted buildings, the underground heating systems of the large centres, all become the refuges for hundreds of "street" children. People involved in the sex industry who are using children, for example recruiters (who could be elder adolescents), look for such children in the regions, suggest that they come to the city and afterwards involve them in the shooting of porno films or other kinds of CSEC. According to the results of previous researches into CSEC in Saint-Petersburg, carried out by the St. Petersburg NGO "Stellit", most minors

who live on the streets and are involved in commercial sexual exploitation, are migrants from the regions.

On the other hand, the cultural and educational institutions are also concentrated in the large centres. Show-business, as was stated above, is also a channel for the involvement of children in prostitution. So a lot of girls and young men – from the regions and the CIS countries – who want to succeed in show-business, dream about working in Saint-Petersburg and Moscow. Recruiters use the advertisements about show-business opportunities with the objective of involving minors in the sex industry (mainly in pornography).

Moreover, the organizers of CSEC, have another benefit in removing children from the regions to the large cities. It is easier to “hide” a child in a large city – nobody will look for him and it is unlikely that he/she will meet relatives or acquaintances on the street. The issue of moving people from the regions to the large centres for involvement in the sex business was covered several times by the mass media in the last two years (but, unfortunately, mainly under the subject of “Crime”). It is easy to move a child from a region and it costs almost nothing, and the incomes made in return in Saint-Petersburg and Moscow are enormous.

There are some circumstances that facilitate trafficking within Russia and the CIS countries. Firstly, no visa is required to travel within the CIS countries. The controls on the movement of minors are not strict. Under these circumstances it is easy to remove a child. Only his birth-certificate is required. A birth-certificate is prepared when a new-born child is registered. Data about his parents, and his date and place of birth are given in it. The birth-certificate is the main identity document for a person under 14 years of age. Details about children are also registered in their parents’ passports. However the photo of the child is not required in either case. In this way the removal of a child within the country is without formality, in comparison with the removal of a child abroad, when the permission from a parent or tutor, and a visa and accompanying adult are formally required.

Secondly, while child prostitution, pornography and sex tourism in Russia have grown, there is a lack of "functioning" laws and of law-enforcement practice in this sphere. Besides, the Russian legislation on the use of minors as prostitutes within the country does not work in a practical sense. So it is easy for those involved in the sex industry to use children for prostitution, establish brothels, and organize sex trips for foreigners to Russia. It is also “safer” for the clients to use children for sexual purposes in Russia, because these children are less protected and there is in fact no responsibility attached to the use of minors. Expert V., *“If a respectable-looking foreigner comes to Saint-Petersburg and sexually abuses children, there is no risk for him. He is interested in keeping a positive image in his surroundings. So it is convenient to come and use children here.”* (V.K., Psychologist).

One of the experts referred to trafficking in Chechnya. During the last decade, there has been a local war on-going in Chechnya. Trafficking there is connected to “military prostitution”. Children are taken to Chechnya from nearby villages and settlements. The children are then used sexually at the military bases.

Ways of recruitment:

As a rule, it is children from dysfunctional families, living in small towns or settlements of Russia and the former USSR republics who become the victims of trafficking. People they know or are acquainted with suggest that they would come to a big city and work. They are promised to be well paid and to be independent. *“Children from marginalised families, who want to leave their surroundings, are promised a normal life, i.e. to work and study, to live in a big beautiful city. Moreover it is mainly people they know who suggest this, so the girl trusts them.” (M.S., Jurist).*

In addition to the children from dysfunctional families, the group “at-risk” of becoming involved in internal trafficking are young people working as models and in show-business. Recruiters and organizers of the sex industry get acquainted with young models and suggest highly-paid work in Moscow or in Saint-Petersburg to them, a successful career and so on.

Ways of removal of a child

As a rule, it is not difficult to remove a child within Russia or from the CIS countries, as stated above. It is usually the minor himself who wants to come to the centre and live. So his removal is often voluntary. However forged documents (a birth certificate) are sometimes used.

Narcotics are also used to remove children (most often within Russia or within the CIS countries): a child is given some drug by an acquaintance in order to remove him without resistance. Sometimes violence is used to capture and remove a child (most often within Russia or within the CIS countries).

Trafficking organization

Undoubtedly, the organization of trafficking within Russia and the CIS countries involves less financial costs and expenses. People from the “marginal” and poor groups of the population are often involved. *“Usually these are people that are criminally motivated. I can’t say that they have big incomes. For example, it could be some Azerbaijani, who sells water-melons... He can sell a girl to someone.” (M.S., Jurist).*

Four experts identified people from the Gypsy races as traffickers. As a rule, they recruit and remove children within Russia and the CIS countries. The problem of stealing, sale and exploitation of children by Gypsies is widely discussed in the mass media and is, generally speaking, a traditional form of child abuse (15-20 years ago, and possibly even earlier, the expression: "If you are naughty the Gypsies will take you away " was a common saying among parents).

Children work under the control of traffickers. As a rule, they provide sexual services at a flat, together with other minors and adult women. Minors can also be involved in street prostitution. In addition, minors are often forced to work as beggars, drug pushers or as sellers at markets.

Clients

The consumers of child sex services can be men and women, often married, and are mainly Russians or from the CIS countries.

Foreign clients often use the sexual services of minors. The North-West of Russia is the most accessible market providing illegal sex services for citizens of the western (Scandinavian) countries. Access is made easier because the westerners have higher incomes than Russians. People from Finland, Sweden, Germany, Norway, England and other European countries are the most common among the foreign clients of minor prostitutes in Saint-Petersburg and the North-West of Russia. African countries, Turkey, the Arab countries, India, Iran, Japan and the USA are mentioned most often among the more distant foreign countries.

Azerbaijan, Georgia, Tajikistan and Uzbekistan are among the neighboring foreign countries from which clients come.

4.4 Prevention strategies

At present there is no system for searching for adults or children who have disappeared in foreign countries, in spite of the widespread trafficking both within the country and abroad. One of the most serious problems is that there are not even approximate statistics on the extent of the trade in human beings. Statistics about the extent to which the trafficking has spread would facilitate promoting the need for prevention strategies. At present it is only possible to analyze the data recorded by the Federal Border Services (statistics on illegal removals abroad), the Federal Migration Service (statistics on repatriation), the Russian consulates in foreign countries (statistics on applications to the consulates by Russian citizens for help), foreign crisis centres for victims of trafficking (statistics on applications to these organizations by Russians for help). According to expert opinion, the law-enforcement authorities must play the key role in finding the victims of trafficking in the receiving countries. The police must carry out swoops on

underground brothels, where they suspect there are children. Interpol must be also involved in the search for disappeared persons.

Experts named the Red Cross as among the organizations that may have information about disappeared children. The International Organisation for Migration can contact the police to assist them search for a disappeared child. Finally the network of non-governmental women's organizations can also assist, if the child had sought help from one of them.

One of experts (M.S., Jurist) had the following suggestions about the search for children in foreign countries. A network of the Christian churches of Europe, Russian NGOs and local police from foreign countries should be established. The churches are located in all European countries, which is not the case for public organizations. Russian NGOs must be informed about disappearances of minors. In their turn they can send an inquiry to the Christian church that then communicates with the local police. It is police work to search for children who have disappeared. Governmental, non-governmental and commercial organizations must be engaged in prevention.

In this way, the following organizations must search for children, who have become the victims of trafficking:

1. Russian and foreign police: look for victims, carry out investigations, bring the traffickers to account.
2. Public organizations: prevention and rehabilitation work with victims of trafficking, assistance in the search for victims.
3. Customs: prevention of illegal removal of minors abroad.
4. Migration agencies: registration of foreigners entering the country, assistance in the search for victims.
5. International organizations, such as Interpol: search for victims, carry out investigations.
6. Government orphanages for children: prevention and rehabilitation work with minor victims of trafficking.
7. Mass Media: forming public opinion, distribution of objective information about the problem of trafficking.
8. Christian churches: assistance in the search for victims.

The following arrangements concerning the prevention of trafficking in minors should be put in place:

- Search for minors – this is the job of the law-enforcement authorities of the Russian Federation, with assistance from non-governmental organizations.

- Circulation of information among the public about trafficking by the Mass Media in cooperation with the Committee on Press and Public Relations.
- Licensing. The granting of licenses to organizations who arrange job placements abroad should be controlled.

But none of these mechanisms will make any sense unless there are also rehabilitation centres and shelters for the victims of trafficking, especially children. As things stand, after the child is returned to Russia he has no place to live and to be cared for if he doesn't have parents or other relatives and tutors. Besides there is no professional psychological, legal and social help for the victims of trafficking.

4.5 Prevention programmes

There are no official prevention, rehabilitation or repatriation programmes for victims of trafficking because this problem is not considered to be significant at government level. Such programmes are developed and implemented by the voluntary agencies, seldom by a government agency.

Among the organizations working on trafficking prevention, the experts mentioned a coalition of governmental and non-governmental agencies named "Angel". It is made up of more than 40 women's organizations and governmental institutions. These organizations do the main prevention work. However, their attention is directed mostly at adult women.

Experts gave details of prevention and rehabilitation programmes, but had no information about repatriation programmes.

Prevention programmes

Early intervention prevention programmes for minors are not widespread in Russia. There is a lack of preventive arrangements and most of them are 'once-off' types of programmes. They are carried out mainly in big cities and directed at the potential 'risk' groups, for example, inmates of children's homes, pupils of vocational schools (who as a rule are from marginalised families, or are orphans). It is important to note that such programmes are directed only at girls. They are managed by public organizations (mainly orphanages), seldom by government agencies.

There is also a telephone helpline run by the crisis centres for women, where women can get advice about work, education, marriage abroad and possible risks. However, information about the helpline, and the numbers, is not widespread.

The following aspects of carrying out prevention programmes are important:

1. Public opinion about trafficking of women and children can only be formed by the provision of systematic and regular information.

2. The work must be done, not only with the 'risk' groups, but also with other groups including school children, parents, teachers.

Trafficking prevention projects are financed by foundations and grant organizations. Such projects fully depend on the provision of finance. For example, if the finance is provided only for a certain period of time, then the project will have to stop as soon as the period is up. Therefore, government support should be provided.

Rehabilitation programmes

Centres providing assistance to the victims of trafficking are being established by those organizations that already provide crisis care for women. As was mentioned, the government does not support such projects. The general policy of the government is that there are no victims of trafficking. So organizations have to fundraise in order to provide care for victims. For this reason, rehabilitation programmes only exist in the big cities of Russia and are mainly directed at adult women.

In Saint-Petersburg the Government Social Rehabilitation Centre "Maloohinski House of Diligence" works with minor victims of trafficking. The Centre runs a project called "Safety Home". During the time of the operation of the project one minor, returned to Russia from a CIS country, came through the rehabilitation programme.

For the successful implementation of rehabilitation programmes, special guarantees and privileges for victims of trafficking are necessary. For this, the government would have to change its attitude towards the problem of trafficking. Only if there are special care provisions can minors who return from another country get proper social and psychological support, a place to live, and some social welfare payments.

4.6 Public awareness

The experts believe that public opinion towards the trafficking in children is formed by the mass media.

Publications on the subject in the media are infrequent. For the most part the stress is on the criminal or sensational material, and this prevents the formation of an understanding that the trafficking of children is widespread and well-developed. The issue of child trafficking does not get the public concern that is necessary to provoke a demand for prevention and rehabilitation programmes.

In any event, the information about CSEC and trafficking in children is mostly distorted in publications and in the media. It can be explained by the fact that child prostitution and

trafficking are forms of sexual exploitation, and sexuality was a forbidden topic for public discussion in the Soviet period. Even today it is still difficult to talk about this issue publicly. Sexuality has become a subject for sensationalism and “hot” facts, for example, about the sex lives of well-known people (charges of paedophilia will get a lot of attention, for example). It is natural that CSEC is one of the most obvious topics for sensational journalism.

A separate theme in the press is the “scandal” factor stories about the sale of new-born children, inmates of children’s homes, and the exposure of people involved in trading children. This problem is perceived simply as isolated incidents, because it is also covered in a sensational way. The reason for such perception is the lack of knowledge on the part of journalists about the problem. In our experience, it is difficult for journalists to be objective and analytical with such themes as drug abuse, the sex industry, sex education and others. Many journalists want to prepare a good report but often they are not able to do it because they have only a superficial knowledge of the problem. It is necessary to do a lot of work with them to inform and educate them on how to write about social problems.

Even specialists in social matters, law-enforcement and other fields have a low level of knowledge about trafficking. Most of the refusals of interviews in the course of this project were due to the lack of information the experts had on the issue. The problem of child trafficking is not even discussed at Russian conferences and workshops.

For all these reasons, the problem of child trafficking is not very high in the public consciousness. The mass media do not have adequate information and are not in the habit of covering the problem of trafficking in children, even though it would be a strong source of information for the public. One of the most important issues is the formation of public attitudes to child trafficking, and this is the basis on which further measures for prevention can be built (for example for lobbying of legislative changes, etc.).

5. Conclusions

1. The problem of CSEC and trafficking of children is not a new phenomenon for Russia. However during the last 10-15 years its forms and extent have changed under the influence of the social, economic, and political changes in the country, followed by changes in sexual behavior, increase in demand for sexual services, the development of the entertainment industry and tourism, the growth of transnational organized criminality and worsening social problems.
2. All forms of CSEC exist in Russia: the use of children in prostitution, pornography, sex tourism and trafficking (both internal and external trafficking).

3. There are many groups of children at risk of being involved in trafficking: children from marginalised families and “street” children, minors working in the modeling business, orphans and children who have graduated from government children’s institutions, adolescents (boys and girls) who are trying to go abroad and who think that this is the only hope they have for the future. On the one hand they are in a difficult social and financial situation; on the other hand, there is a contradiction between their idea about living abroad and the reality they face.
4. The removal of children abroad is arranged by traffickers in different ways. It depends on a minor’s age. Minors under 14 are, as a rule, removed without giving them information about what will happen to them. Minors between the ages of 14 and 18 are offered various forms of work in the service industry, show-business, etc., in some cases they are offered exchange programmes. Such children are driven by the urge to earn money.
5. The illegal removal of children can happen in different ways: the departure could be with an adult, who has the name of the child registered on his/her passport; it could be with forged documents; it could be the adoption of a child by foreigners; it could be through marriage to the mother of children; it could be by surrogate motherhood. Due to the modern Russian passport regime there are many ways in which children over 14 can be removed (those who do not have their own passport).
6. Trafficking of children to foreign countries is a well-developed activity of criminal groups. The children are brought to countries of Western Europe (Germany, Italy, Cyprus, Denmark, France, Sweden), and also to the USA, China, Korea, Japan, Israel and Turkey. The children can be taken for different purposes – both to brothels and for individual clients.
7. Internal trafficking within Russia and the CIS countries (Moldova, Belarus, Ukraine, Kazakhstan) is widespread, due to the demand for sexual services, including child prostitution, in the big cities (mainly Moscow and Saint-Petersburg). Besides it is not expensive to remove children within the country, so the traffickers don’t face any obstacles but can make a large profit.
8. The system of social control over children that existed during the Soviet period and provided medical and educational care came to an end during the 1980s and 1990s. There is no system of social control at present, so children have become one of the most unprotected sectors in Russian society. It is this lack of protection mechanisms that have led to the development of CSEC.
9. Modern Russian legislation regulates the sale of persons, illegal removal from the country, and involvement in youth prostitution, even though there are no legal provisions to cover trafficking (including child trafficking). But most of the articles don’t work in practice because the problem of child trafficking is not considered important at government level. Other reasons why the law does not work are the difficulties of working on such cases, and also a lack of willingness on the

part of the law-enforcement authorities to work in this area. Other factors are distrust and lack of knowledge on the part of the public, and victims, about the legislation.

10. In spite of the fact that Russia has signed several international conventions and protocols concerning the prevention of people and child trafficking, the implementation mechanisms for these undertakings have not been put in place.

11. There is a very low level of knowledge among social service, public health and migration professionals. This is the reason for the low level of activity on the part of these sectors in relation to child trafficking prevention.

12. In spite of the extent of the problem of child trafficking and the difficult consequences for its victims, no importance is attached to it at government level. The absence of research and statistics about child trafficking complicates the implementation of legislative and administrative rules.

13. Actions to locate and return the victims of trafficking are not coherent at present because they are carried out by the different organizations with minimal resources. Another problem is the absence of refuges and rehabilitation centres and programmes for children who have become the victims of trafficking.

14. The prevention programmes targeted at children and young people do not cover such issues as commercial sexual exploitation, trafficking, and sexual violence. These problems are currently associated in people's minds with "bad" families, and "bad" people, and not as a widespread problem that concerns everyone.

15. In the public mind, child trafficking only happens in isolated cases, and is usually connected with paedophilia. No useful work is being done to raise public understanding about the problem. Furthermore, journalists often face difficulties because of their lack of information on the subject.

6. Case studies

Case 1 (G.V., Director of an orphanage).

M., 15 years old, orphan, lived in a former Soviet republic, in the countryside. She grew up in an orphanage, had brothers who didn't want to take any responsibility for her. The girl got to know some gypsies who suggested that she work in Moscow at the market to earn some money. First she refused, but they started to work on her psychologically, to persuade her to go to the other city. Finally she was taken to another city with forged documents. She ended up not in Moscow but in St. Petersburg and was chained to the wheelchair of an old invalid. She was not involved

in prostitution because she was ill with syphilis. She was beaten up until she was bleeding when she refused to do that job. Money that she earned from begging was taken away from her. She did not know Russian and was forced to go with the invalid and do everything the owners told her. Her slavery did not last long. They were stopped by the police and as she did not have documents, M. was sent to one of the orphanages in the city. She ended up in hospital with serious diseases.

M. lived in the orphanage for 7 months, and was treated 5 times in hospital. Then she was taken back to her home by the staff of the orphanage and was put into the care of an organization dealing with trafficked victims.

Case 2 (M.S., Jurist)

This story is also about a girl from a republic of the former Soviet Union. It happened in 2002. A school-girl, 16 years of age, was kidnapped from her home city.

The girl met a young man who offered her to take her for a walk and to drink some alcohol. She agreed. After that she does not remember anything. Evidently, there was a soporific in the alcohol.

When the girl came to her senses, she found that she is in St. Petersburg. The girl was taken to an apartment and she was forced to serve clients. Porno movies were also made at the apartment. At the apartment there were other minor girls. Then she came to be trusted and she was allowed to go outside. At one moment she escaped and was detained by the police.

The girl told her story to the police. The police arrested the organizers for keeping a brothel, because the kidnapping was impossible to prove. The girl was returned to her home city and to her family.

Case 3 (M.S., Jurist)

A girl of 16 years of age lived in a former Soviet republic. In her city she met a man from Azerbaijan, a pimp. She was taken by him to Moscow with false documents. He beat and raped her to break her resistance and forced her to prostitute herself. He let her call home. She told her family that she was working as a cook.

When the girl couldn't endure the humiliating and cruel treatment any longer, she gave her "owner" several knife stabs. He was seriously injured. The girl was put in jail while the investigation is carried out, and she will be given a long sentence of imprisonment. During her detention, friends of the pimp visited her, and blackmailed her that if she gives evidence, her little sister will suffer.

The girl has no education, and is of low intellectual development. She has no money for a lawyer. The Moscow women's crisis centre did not give her any assistance. In the opinion of the expert, it will be really difficult for her to get off on the charges.

Bibliography

1. Арефьев А. Ненужные дети России. <http://demoscope.ru/weekly/2003/0113/tema01.php>
2. Буряк М. Протокол ООН 2000 года против торговли людьми. // Торговля людьми. Социокриминологический анализ / Под общей редакцией Е.В. Тюрюкановой и Л.Д. Ерохиной. М.: Academia, 2002. – с. 210 – 216.
3. Волкова Г. Поговорим о трэффике. // Изнасилованные судьбы. Методическое пособие. Сборник № 2. СПб, 2001 г. – с. 35 – 40.
4. Государственный доклад "О положении детей в Российской Федерации" / Министерство труда и социального развития. М.: 2001.
5. Ерохина Л. Торговля женщинами: феномен реальный или надуманный? // Торговля людьми. Социокриминологический анализ / Под общей редакцией Е.В. Тюрюкановой и Л.Д. Ерохиной. М.: Academia, 2002. – с. 35 – 59.
6. Ерохина Л.Д., Буряк М.Ю. Торговля женщинами в целях сексуальной эксплуатации. Теория и практика борьбы. Учебное пособие. Владивосток: Изд-во Дальневост. ун-та, 2001. – 196 с.
7. Информационный вестник по предупреждению детской безнадзорности и противоправного поведения несовершеннолетних (в части социальной работы с семьей) / Под ред. Т.В. Тихоновой. – СПб: изд-во СПбГУ, 2002. – 192 с.
8. Информационный вестник по предупреждению детской безнадзорности и противоправного поведения несовершеннолетних (в части технологии разрешения семейных конфликтов). – СПб: изд-во СПбГУ, 2002. – 128 с.
9. Клейменов М., Шакмков С. Криминальное перемещение людей: возможности противодействия. // Торговля людьми. Социокриминологический анализ / Под общей редакцией Е.В. Тюрюкановой и Л.Д. Ерохиной. М.: Academia, 2002. – с. 89 – 134.
10. Периодический доклад о реализации Российской Федерацией Конвенции о правах ребенка в 1998–2002 годах, http://detirossii.narod.ru/Dok2konv.htm#_Toc26969791

11. Периодический доклад о реализации Российской Федерацией Конвенции о правах ребенка в 1993 – 1997 гг. годах // Семья в России. 1997-№ 4. Специальный выпуск.- 208 с.
12. Поддержка семьи как средство профилактики социального сиротства и безнадзорности в Санкт-Петербурге. СПб: Изд-во СПбБОО «Центр РНО», 2003. – 48 с.
13. Репецкая А. Классификация криминальной эксплуатации людей и проблемы уголовной ответственности за нее. // Торговля людьми. Социокриминологический анализ / Под общей редакцией Е.В. Тюрюкановой и Л.Д. Ерохиной. М.: Academia, 2002. – с. 59 – 88.
14. Россия в цифрах. 2003: Крат. стат. сб. / Госкомстат России. – М.,2003. – 398 с.
15. Сеницын Ф.Л. Международное законодательство по проблеме торговли людьми. – Пермь, 2000.- 94 стр.
16. Стокер С. Торговля людьми как одна из форм организованной преступности. // Торговля людьми. Социокриминологический анализ / Под общей редакцией Е.В. Тюрюкановой и Л.Д. Ерохиной. М.: Academia, 2002. – с. 10 – 34.
17. Тюрюканова Е. Женская трудовая миграция и торговля людьми из России в контексте мирового миграционного режима. // Торговля людьми. Социокриминологический анализ / Под общей редакцией Е.В. Тюрюкановой и Л.Д. Ерохиной. М.: Academia, 2002. – с. 135 – 165.
18. Уголовный кодекс РФ
19. Численность населения Российской Федерации по полу и возрасту на 1 января 2002 года (Статистический бюллетень) / Госкомстат России. М., 2002.